

PROGRAM HNA Conference 2022

***Friday 3 June 2022, The Hague
Afternoon (14:30-16:00)***

Nature's End: Ecology and Exploitation in Seventeenth-Century Dutch Landscape Painting

SESSION ORGANIZERS

Joost Keizer, University of Groningen

Ann-Sophie Lehmann, University of Groningen

With a sudden intensity, early seventeenth-century Dutch artists began picturing their own environment, launching an entirely new category of representation that tested the boundaries between man and nature, representation and truth, and past and future. These pictures do more than show a real, often familiar, landscape. They also depict how humans experience nature. Thousands of landscape paintings – most of them of an underestimated artistic radicality – interrogate the boundaries between nature and culture. They map out what past and future ecologies look like. And place us humans in the midst of them. Landscape paintings intersect with a set of early modern questions about how to use and preserve the land. They open up new venues of sight from a use-perspective (of farmers in the dirt, fishermen on the beach); they draw visual attention to the boundaries between landscape (*landschap*) and the dunes (called the *wildernisse*); they speak of the erosion of the coast; they visualize what humans did with and to nature; they distinguish classes of looking and using (from strolling city-dwellers to a bent-over sower). Apart from the visual wealth of information about living in and of cultured nature, an untapped variety of Dutch early modern textual sources speaks to the ecology of human life and the land humans occupy, which has been studied surprisingly little with regard to landscape painting.

This panel discusses these questions of ecology and exploitation in landscape painting.

SPEAKERS

Amy Knight Powell, University of Southern California

Ecologies of Sand

Around 1600, the coastal dunes near Haarlem became a major motif in Dutch landscape drawings, prints, and paintings. Dunes are nature's ruin, made of sand, particles of stone, ordinary, unshaped stones but also stones that were once carved into sculptures or assembled into architectural structures. Sand is those stones (and sculptures and structures) ground down into a corpuscular, quasi-liquid, time-telling record of decay. Images of Holland's relatively sparsely populated coastal dunes allowed for a fantasy of wilderness in a country that was already famous for being shaped by man rather than nature. (Formal management of the dunes, which protect the low-lying hinterland from flooding, had already begun in the sixteenth century.) The fictional Dutch desert was a local, internal wilderness—a wilderness in two senses.

First, internal to the nation, Egypt brought to Holland. This trope capitalized on a certain superficial resemblance between the sandy ecology of Europe's coastline and the sandy ecology of the desert to which early Christian ascetics had retreated. It was the substance of sand (loose, granular, eroded rock) that made this analogy possible, specifically the quasi-liquid, corpuscular quality of sand that made it possible for the ecology of the desert to flow from Egypt to Holland. Once monuments and edifices have been ground down into sandy ruins, place can slide. Once place is atomized, it can be displaced.

The second sense in which Holland's sandy wilderness was an internal place is that it was a figure for the deep, intensive structure of matter. Holland's desert stood for the wilderness that the microscope and particulate theories of matter were opening up beneath the surfaces of what one could see. After describing the sand in which he finds a small shell, Hooke reports: "I Have often observed the Sand or Gravel of Urine, which seems to be . . . generated out of a saline and a terrestrial substance crystallized together, in the form of Tartar, sometimes sticking to the sides of the Urinal, but for the most part sinking to the bottom, and there lying in the form of coarse, common Sand" (Hooke, *Micrographia*, 1665). With his microscope, Hooke discovers sandy drifts deep inside the human body—a lonely landscape that is no longer far away but instead lodged in the most intimate recesses of the physical self.

The sandy ecology of Holland's dunes was local and specific and yet subject to metaphoric displacements of several kinds.

Christopher P. Heuer, University of Rochester

Antiquity Without Humans: The Primordial Landscapes of Cornelis van Dalem

The artist Cornelis van Dalem (1530-1575) offered the world a small corpus of painted meditations on time. His so-called *Dawn of Civilization* (1565) now in Rotterdam, for example, has puzzled scholars for decades. The panel depicts a grotto scene with early humans and animals, all amidst rocky cliffs and trees indebted to Dürer. No Netherlandish artist had explored the subject before. Stemming loosely from Lucretius, Dalem presents the scene as geologic in character (van Mander referred to the painter as a "fraye schilder van rotsen".) But the painting also engages the idea of natural history and "environment" at a moment of iconoclasm and colonialism. It interrogates the very relationship between humans and animals, and the "separation" that takes place - in social as well as artistic terms - when civilization appears.

Lisa Wiersma, Utrecht University

Cultivated Creation: Selecting from Nature in Art and Reality in the Seventeenth-Century Netherlands

In the inconspicuous, yet highly informative treatise on painting, *The Big World Painted Small* (1692), Willem Beurs gives instructions for painting the 17th-century environment. The author, who was a painter himself, aimed at painting from life, or at observing reality to make a meticulous and convincing depiction. By using (standardized) recipes nature was,

however, shown in its best possible manifestation: the specific combinations of colours are fundamental to 17th-century paintings's convincingness and appeal. Not only does this source show how painters beautified their surroundings, it gives a unique, aesthetically motivated insight into 17th-century's taste for nature and agriculture, as well. One out of six books is devoted to landscape painting entirely. Skies, grounds and waters are decomposed in spatial parts and colours or colour mixtures, offering painters a system to hold onto while handling the brush. Furthermore, every thinkable object or being that could adorn such a view is treated in the other books discussing flowers, fish, birds, insects, man-made things, fruits, quadruped animals and humans.

Contrary to many animals that Willem Beurs provides a painting recipe for, most herbs seem to have been at his and his readership's disposal. The fruit trade was a lively one, yet Beurs' chapter on exotic fruits is brief: it treats pomegranates, oranges, lemons, chestnuts, olives and capers. Would this mean that all other fruits that are discussed, such as peaches and grapes, were regional? And chestnuts were foreign, but melons were not? And how about the flowers, pictured in Beurs' initial color exercises: had a medical or botanical garden to be visited to see them, was access to a manorial estate needed, or was every market garden generally embellished with a strip of african marigolds? With Beurs, landscape or garden paintings and horticultural sources at hand, Dutch horticulture will be explored. The author could rely on familiarity and did not mention any literature, whereas natural philosophy and prints are explicitly mentioned regarding the animal kingdom. Botany was an old area of expertise that had been the domain of medical practitioners and pharmacists, aristocratic land owners, and of everyone with a vegetable garden. Knowledge of horticulture and assorted edibles became more common among citizens as the number of orchards, herb and vegetable gardens around Dutch cities increased to feed the growing populations from the sixteenth century onward. People would visit the countryside of the town walls, where pleasure gardens were realized around these functional gardens. The growing of ostentatious vegetation came into vogue among wealthy citizens in the Dutch Republic in the 1660s, with urgings in horticulturalist publications, such as Jan van der Groen's 1669 *Den nederlandsen hovenier* ('The Dutch Horticulturalist').

We will see that the taste for surroundings that Beurs and many garden and landscape paintings demonstrate, is that for a flourishing cultivated landscape that reflects gardening achievements and styles. Both early modern horticulturalists and painters felt they were engaging with Creation and with scientific precision; beholders were invited to see and sense it.

Catherine Levesque, The College of William and Mary

Ruisdael's Grainfields and the Ecological Landscape

Jacob Ruisdael's landscapes of dunes and country roads reveal his pronounced attention to finding a technique for inscribing the details of nature he observed so closely in paintings, a consistent concern in his early work. Even Ruisdael's depiction of soil, his attention to the differences of color, texture, and weight reveal just how closely he observed and meticulously recorded his environment—not only (as long recognized) of wind and clouds but on their action on the earth, of the growth of plants but also their relationship to particular kinds of soil. Though other painters—especially of dune landscapes—show the

effects of wind and erosion, it is not with such specificity. Even Ruisdael's soil formations and stratification are closely observed and rendered. Consequently, this examination of the artist's "ecological" landscapes is also an examination of his material practice. Moreover, his emphasis on labor and transformation in his process of making is of a piece with his subject matter. Both would have been appreciated by his likely patrons. This preoccupation with finding a way of making such images is best captured by the term *technē*, the process by which an artist such as Ruisdael worked to embody what he saw (the domain of 'knowledge') by means of his craft (practice). *Technē* so understood considers the work of art as including the labor and explorations required to effect the best possible solution. In Ruisdael's case, that would be to capture the structure, morphology, and even something of the sprightliness of natural forms.

By labeling Ruisdael's grainfields as ecological, I intend to highlight his central concern with an environment as a dynamic place. Ruisdael's attention to the details of a poor but arable landscape is not to suggest that he had an extraordinary concern with farming—but certainly an awareness of agricultural improvement would not have been unusual for anyone who saw the development of property in and around the dunes. The relationship of wild and the sown land in Ruisdael's paintings is of a piece with the general preoccupation with soil fertility in his time and place. Moreover, his range of ground cover and his attention to the morphology, physiology, and ecology of plants within a carefully observed local landscape makes evident its potential for regeneration; consistently an interest in accord with his choice of subject matter and the way he depicts it. The emphasis on borders or different zones of ground and growth is especially to the fore in Ruisdael's depiction of landscapes that embrace both barren and the fertile ground. In these works his geological exactitude in describing the play between different natural environments—edges, borders, and boundaries—is as precise as his description of individual species. This boundary between the wild and the sown, and Ruisdael's technique in conveying this as a dynamic environment is the topic of my talk. His labor (and awareness of that labor as *tēchne* or process) in drawings, etchings, and various kinds of paintings in conveying that dynamic is its substance.

PRESENTATION

Specifying Site: Making Meaning through Space and Place in Northern Art

SESSION ORGANIZERS

Saskia Beranek, Illinois State University

Jacquelyn N. Coutré, Art Institute of Chicago

A number of recent museum renovations, from the Gruuthusemuseum in Bruges to the Museum De Lakenhal in Leiden, have sought to highlight the early modern context of their buildings for the presentation of their northern European collections. Such gallery environments often feature period tapestries and architectural elements, historic installations of artworks, and minimal signage. And yet, in spite of these ambitious constructions, these galleries remain emulative spaces. In contrast, other institutions have embraced the white-cube approach, one that completely negates any reference to historic

context and lays bare the intentions of the institution's spaces as purely exhibitionary. As scholarship in other fields increasingly considers experience and display, such as Gail Feigenbaum's *Display of Art in the Roman Palace, 1550-1750* (2014) or Maria Maurer's *Gender, Space and Experience at the Renaissance Court: Performance and Practice at the Palazzo Te* (2019), specialists in the art of Northern Europe can and should contend with the distinct range of viewing experiences created in and for northern audiences.

This panel seeks to explore the relationships between works of art and their original environments in order to answer questions about how aesthetic, spiritual, political, and social aspirations were not internal to discrete objects but contingent on physical surroundings and spatial relationships. How did other sensory experiences, from the tactile to the olfactory to the auditory, contribute to the artwork's affect? How was meaning constructed (whether deliberately or by chance) through the juxtaposition of paintings, sculptures, works on paper and decorative arts within a defined space, and how did this meaning inflect a viewer's understanding of the individual or collective identity of the owner(s)? How did the viewer participate in the owner-constructed ritual of the viewing experience? To what extent do environments privilege specific artworks, and to what extent has that shaped the history of art history? Lastly, how do contemporary scholars and curators responsibly access and present the embodied experience of early modern viewers to 21st-century audiences? We invite papers that present new research on "art in context" across northern Europe between 1400 and 1800 and welcome discussions of the intersections between the built, natural and social environments.

SPEAKERS

Laura Tillery, Hamilton College

Altarpieces Made Elsewhere: The "Import" of Carved and Polychromed Altarpieces in Norway in Context

Over thirty carved and polychromed retables made in fifteenth and early-sixteenth century workshops in the Netherlands and northern Germany arrived through mercantile trade routes to be installed in small parish churches scattered throughout the coast in central and northern Norway. These multimedia ensembles structurally bear a context for transport in their small, compact design which typically feature a shallow carved and polychromed corpus with single-standing saints enclosed with painted wings. While foundational studies on the retables focused primarily on stylistic workshop attributions to Lübeck masters, and more recently, technical investigations determined specific regions of origin, this paper seeks to reconsider the surviving retables in terms of their local contexts after arrival. In other words, we know how these objects were made, and often, where they were made, yet what did these objects contribute to their local environment and community? Simply put, how did these objects work in situ? The acquisition and installation of a winged retable in a small church would have been a tremendous occasion for the local viewing community; decidedly different in format from free-standing polychromed sculpture, painted altar frontals, and multi-colored wall paintings from the earlier medieval centuries that filled local churches, the multimedia winged altarpiece stood to carry a range of visual, social, and economic associations as an "imported" liturgical object. Rather than focusing on a single case study,

this paper takes a wide lens to examine the common trends of retables in situ to determine the intersection between an object made elsewhere in the local church environment.

Adam Sammut, University of York

Saints Dominic and Francis Saving the World from the Wrath of Christ: Rubens' High Altarpiece for the Dominican church in Antwerp in Situ

Saints Dominic and Francis saving the world from the wrath of Christ is a spectacular altarpiece by Rubens, painted c. 1618-1620 for the Dominican church in Antwerp, today St Paul's (Musée des Beaux-Arts, Lyon). While appreciated by Stendhal for its 'veracity and liveliness,' the meaning of the altarpiece was contingent on its liturgical context. It was commissioned by Michaël Ophovius who served as prior of the monastery, prefect of the Dominican mission to the Dutch Republic and bishop of 's-Hertogenbosch until 1629; the figure of St Dominic is his pseudo-portrait. By having the order's patron saint save the world from destruction through penance and intercession, the altarpiece urged monastery friars to follow Ophovius and join the Dutch Mission. While putting regular mendicancy at the centre of Antwerp's confessional topography, the altarpiece was supra-Catholic in rhetoric. Placing St Dominic within a pantheon of Roman martyrs including saints Sebastian, Catherine of Alexandria and Flavia Domitilla, it evoked the Vatican's post-Tridentine project of the Early Christian revival which as the placement of the globe indicates was a central tenet of Catholic global mission.

This paper is the first to consider the *Wrath of Christ's* liturgical installation as devised by Rubens and Ophovius. The choir was built in the 1630s to replace the one demolished during the Calvinist Republic (1577-1585); building work was set in motion and partly financed by Ophovius. When 's-Hertogenbosch was captured by Frederik Hendrik, Ophovius sent ornaments and silverware from St John's Cathedral to the Antwerp monastery. In 1631 Ophovius met with Rubens 'in order to discuss his place of burial' and this paper interprets the choir as Ophovius' funeral chapel. With his effigy standing next to the high altar this doubled the rhetorical power of the choir as a *machina spiritualis*, the purpose of which was to generate missionary zeal among novices. Just as the Holy Sepulchre and Loreto's *Casa Santa* were replicated across Christendom, different sacred spaces were telescoped within the choir of the Dominican church. Rome, the *fons et origo* of Catholic sanctity was evoked through the *Wrath of Christ's* hagiographic *romanitas* while 's-Hertogenbosch was signposted by precious objects recovered from the cathedral treasury. The collapsing of 's-Hertogenbosch within Antwerp was made literal by its "Babylonian captivity" which made Antwerp the new "little Rome" on the frontier with the Dutch Republic. The choir had another outstanding feature: a stained glass series by Abraham van Diepenbeeck depicting the life of St Paul in ten windows. By presenting newly-discovered oil sketches and outlining its sequence for the first time, this paper interprets the stained glass as an extension of the *Wrath of Christ's* iconographic discourse which contributed to a decorative ensemble that ultimately advocated the unification of Europe under papal primacy and Habsburg hegemony.

Pamela Bianchi, Paris 8 University

Dutch and Venetian Dwellings: Early Exhibiting Practices and Spaces in the Seventeenth Century

Before the appearance of the early painting exhibitions and the first spaces specially designed to collect and present collections, the action of showing art was mainly related to the habit of dressing up spaces (Rodolfo, Volpi, 2014) for political and religious commemorations, cultural festivals, or marketing strategies. Thus, various venues (palaces, churches, cloisters, façades, squares, ephemeral pavilions, fairs, shops, ...), where sociability was performed and experienced (Furlotti, 2015), ended up becoming temporary and privileged platforms for the first exhibiting forms. The study of these occasions and their pictorial and literary imagery is today an iconic resource to trace the roots of contemporary exhibition processes in the rudimentary exhibition activities of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Europe.

Although Italy was the fulcrum of these events, sixteenth-century Dutch profound economic change, and the consequent new art market system played a fruitful role in the evolution of the early exhibition practices and related spaces. Painting galleries (*schilderspand*), *pand*, and fairs exhibiting devices are the cases in point. However, domestic and private interiors and their setting-up have played an equally important role, even though the topic has received little attention from the literature.

Starting from these considerations, the paper studies seventeenth-century Dutch burghers' dwellings and the layout of works of art within them. It focuses on the Dutch Golden Age, when the society's richness arose alongside a progressive transformation of the domestic interiors' decoration and furnishings. There, Dutch owners began by gathering goods and works of art in specific rooms, and then by distributing them in the whole house, following the imagery of the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Italian *palazzi*. Specifically, Dutch dwellings' design reminds of Venetian houses, the distribution of paintings and artefacts inside their rooms, and the idea of the house as an architectural self-portrait of its owner, that spread throughout sixteenth-century Italy. This relationship is not surprising if one thinks that Venice, unlike Rome, developed an idea of domestic collecting and art market, not linked to the clergy, but closer to Venetian burghers' habits and tastes.

Therefore, the paper aims to draw parallels between the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Dutch and Venetian burghers' dwellings, thanks to the study of a few iconic cases, and the analysis of paintings, dolls' houses, inventories and treatises. William Sanderson's *Graphice* (1658), Samuel van Hoogstraten's perspective box, *Peepshow* (1650), and Gabriel Metsu's paintings will give us important insights into the display practices of Dutch dwellings, while Pietro Aretino's letters and Marcantonio Michiel's notes will allow us to explore the Venetian house of Milanese-born collector Andrea Odoni. Although the paper mostly focuses on seventeenth-century Dutch domestic interiors and the layout of works of art within them, the cross-study with the Venetian case will show congruences and inconsistencies, by raising questions about the relationship between changes in Dutch society and processes of exhibiting and setting-up. Also, it will explore Dutch society's contribution to defining the evolution of the exhibition-making history, ending up placing it within the historiographical research of contemporary exhibiting practices.

The Performativity of Liturgical Art II

SESSION ORGANIZERS

Ralph Dekoninck, UCLouvain,

Barbara Baert, KU Leuven

Marie-Christine Claes, KIK-IRPA, Brussels

This session seeks to investigate the performativity of the late medieval and early modern liturgical heritage from the Southern Netherlands. As liturgical objects are endowed with a ritually instituted efficacy, they lead indeed to a reflection on performativity. The *performative turn* in the Humanities is in line with the renewed interest in rituals and their relationships to objects, artistic or not. This approach has opened new avenues of research in art history. In this respect, we may say that art is performative insofar as it engages the spectator in a performance; it could even be argued that art is effective only when it is performed. The art object can be therefore considered as an *agent*, that is to say, as an object endowed with an ability to act or to trigger reactions and not simply as a thing to be interpreted as a passive vector of forms and ideas.

This session aims to study these objects within the wide network of relationships that shape their meaning and their efficacy: the relationship with their spatial environment, especially with the rituals performed in this environment, the relationship with their users, but also the relationship between the different objects themselves. Liturgical objects – such as chasubles, copes, altar frontals, chalices, monstrances, altar bells... – were displayed and used in a certain order and were part of a network not only of other artefacts, but also of images, gestures, words, sounds and smells. Issues related to the contextualization of the liturgical objects in their spatial, material and religious environment will be explored so as to provide a renewed analysis of their ritual and artistic significance.

SESSION 2

SPEAKERS

Lynn F. Jacobs, University of Arkansas

Performing Interiority: The Chapel Space and the Antwerp Carved Altarpiece at Ringsaker

Netherlandish carved altarpieces are well known for the way in which the compartments of their sculpted caisses are typically configured in the form of so-called chapel spaces, that is, as miniaturized chapels, with their back and side walls articulated with Gothic tracery and their ceilings covered with vaulting. As a result, the retables' sculpted scenes (typically narrative events of the Passion or Infancy) appear within interior spaces, regardless of whether the scenes historically occurred in outdoor spaces. Thus, for example, in the Dijon Passion Altarpiece, an Antwerp work of c. 1510-20, the Crucifixion appears in front of the skyline of Jerusalem, all contained within a chapel-like enclosure, so that Christ and the thieves hang on crosses set in front of Gothic lancet windows and surmounted by tracery baldachins and a vaulted ceiling.

This paper argues that the chapel spaces in carved altarpieces perform interiority on the interior of the altarpiece, and in this way elicit the interiority that they wish their viewers to perform. Interiority held deep significance within religious practices of the late middle ages, and is evident in calls for inwardness in prayer rubrics, in mystical writings discussing uniting with God in secret chambers, and in guides to pilgrimages that offered indulgences for travels that took place only in the mind. Interiority was also a key value of the *Devotio Moderna*, one of the most influential religious movements in the Lowlands, which emphasized identification with Christ through contemplative meditation on his life and Passion. One of the central texts of the movement, the *Imitation of Christ*, is organized under four rubrics, of which one is an “Admonition drawing [you] to internal things,” which begins saying that the reader will receive Christ’s consolations “if you have prepared a worthy dwelling for him from within.”

The Ringsaker Altarpiece, a sixteenth-century Antwerp altarpiece exported to Norway, provides a case study in how the chapel space functions within a work designed to assure the donor’s salvation. The entire *caisse* is articulated as chapel spaces, which derive sanctity through their articulation with gilded Gothic decoration of celestial refinement and delicacy; the miniaturization of the figures within them; their illogical inclusion of outdoor settings; and their location on the often concealed interior of the altarpiece. This latter feature, which allows the chapel space to doubly mark the interior of the altarpiece *as* an interior, leverages the chapel space’s *Medialität* by exploiting its position within a winged structure. The opened *predella* at Ringsaker, depicting the Last Judgment, is the only sculpted section where the chapel space is absent. Its absence indicates that the Last Judgment represents the endpoint of interiority. The souls, now naked in a barren landscape, must face judgment before finding admittance into either the portal of Heaven or the mouth of Hell—spaces that could not be contained within chapels. In Ringsaker’s *predella*, the desire to enter Heaven’s interior is unveiled as the motivation for the performance of interiority in the altarpiece’s *caisse* and its goal of eliciting a similar performance from its viewers.

Valentine Langlais, University Paul Valéry, Montpellier III

The Last Supper on the Altarpieces of the Holy Sacrament: a performative representation of the Catholic Mass

During the 16th and 17th centuries, we can observe the multiplication of depictions of the Last Supper, the founding episode of the Mass rite, on Catholic altarpieces in the Netherlands, especially in the Chapels of the Holy Sacrament. The altarpiece is one of the liturgical objects present on the Catholic altar and one of the essential supports of the Catholic faith in churches. Displayed on the altar, it is both the visual support of the Church of Rome’s dogmas and a tool acting to make the divine presence on earth.

While the Church must reaffirm the dogma of transubstantiation, the doctrine of the Mass, and define precisely the liturgy used during the celebration of the Holy Sacrament, the episode of the Last Supper seems particularly adapted to these different objectives. Because of the fundamental link between the Mass and the Last Supper, and the theological implications of this episode for Catholics, the Last Supper seems particularly suitable for an altarpiece: it is here a question of presenting the founding episode of the rite taking place in

front of the altar. This way, the depiction of the Last Supper on an altarpiece becomes performative.

The Netherlandish artists create a *mise en abyme* in the iconography of the Last Supper between, on the one hand, the historical Supper lived by Christ and Apostles and, the other hand, the rite of Mass lived by the priest and contemporary faithful, but also between Christ and the priest themselves. The Mass is then perceived as a repetition, or even a reenactment, of the Last Supper celebrated by Christ. To make obvious this analogy, the painters borrow a large number of elements from the Catholic rite: Christ's gesture, the *benediction latina*, the offering of the bread or the elevation of the host; the liturgical objects as the *vasa sacra*, especially the paten and the chalice, or less often, the monstrance; the lights, curtains or even canopies. By depicting the Last Supper with these liturgical codes of the Mass, in particular by the inclusion of liturgical objects, the artists establish a visual continuity between the Last Supper and the Mass : through the *mise en abyme*, the faithful have the impression that the Last Supper takes place in a space identical to the one in which they are, and that they themselves attend the celebration of the Eucharist by Christ. That is why we can say that the representation of the Last Supper on altarpiece is performative.

This is particularly obvious on the altarpieces painted for the Chapels of the Holy Sacrament, where the iconography of the Last Supper is deeply marked by the liturgy of the Mass. Through some accurate examples of Catholic Netherlandish altarpieces from these Chapels – painted by Michiel Coxcie or Ambrosius Francken – we aim to show how the representation of the Last Supper is performative, since it engages the spectator in a performance, that is, the celebration of the first Mass by Christ in the model of the contemporary Mass, because of their position on the altar and the use of the liturgical objects in the decorum.

Junko Ninagawa, Kansai University

Visual Instructions for Performing Rituals – Images of Sacraments

Concerning the performance of rituals, the images of the seven sacraments shouldn't be missed, as they play a role as visual instructions for how to activate sacraments. As S. Gieben states, generally speaking, scholastic theology made use of the Aristotelian terms of matter and form for the explanation of sacraments. However, they weren't conceived in their strictly philosophical significance, but in the more general sense of indeterminate element, or matter, and determining element, or form. This dichotomy is interdependent, or reciprocal. The systematization of Thomas Aquinas, whose words determined the rank, or order, of sacraments, is not followed in the painting by Rogier van der Weyden, where the factor to determine the order seems to be the aging steps of human life or matter. The order of Rogier (or the commissioner) is not always followed as it is, of course.

Next, I'll explain a series of engravings brought by Western missionaries to Japan in the 16th or 17th century. It's called the Seven Petitions of Oratio Dominica with Seven Sacraments and Seven Virtues, and it's a series of six engravings kept at the Ibaraki Municipal Museum of Cultural Assets. It's a rare example of a Christian heirloom from a time when Christianity was gradually being strictly banned in Japan. The series originally consisted of eight pages, and the original version seems to have been invented by a German engraver, Matthaues

Greuter (1565/6 Strasburg-1638 Roma). Derivative prints are housed in several European libraries or museums, including the National Library of France (BnF), whose version, which was made in Lyon, seems to be the earliest. According to Hollstein, besides the Paris version, there are similar complete versions like Vienna's (which is actually preserved in the archive of Schlegel Monastery), Erlangen's, and a Roman one. The iconographies of the Roman one are quite different from those of the one in Paris, but they all share a similar cover page. The reason I'd like to discuss them in this session on Netherlandish art is that on the cartouche of the Japanese cover, which is terribly damaged, you can see the word 'Flan,' probably indicating Flanders. Indeed, missionaries from Iberian countries brought a lot of ritual books or goods made in the Netherlands.

Here the words *Oratio Dominica* determined the order of sacraments and virtues, which does not follow those of Aquinas or Van der Weyden. It's interesting to see that Eve, seen on the page of the sixth petition with the Sacrament of Marriage, is depicted fully clothed while the European versions show her almost naked. The substance seems to be altered according to the missionary's purpose, probably in the Netherlands. Regarding the interdependency of the form and subject matter, I'll discuss the cartouche images at the bottom of the pages, which show scenes of people performing rituals, explaining how to pray to God, how to use the depicted devices, how to behave, how to occupy space, and so on.

The RKD – Netherlands Institute for Art History and its Research Sources

SESSION ORGANIZERS

Ellis Dullaart, Nadja Garthoff, Suzanne Laemers, Sytske Weidema, and Margreet Wolters

LOCATION

RKD – Netherlands Institute for Art History, The Hague

The RKD – Netherlands Institute for Art History has long been known for its extensive collection of visual documentation, its archives and art-historical library. Moreover, continuous developments in the field of digitization have led to an extensive digital infrastructure, called *Explore*. *Explore* currently consists of eight different online databases with a large and versatile amount of art historical information, ranging from biographical data relating to artists to technical documentation of works of art. Recently, the RKD has digitized most of its visual documentation – previously available in the well-known green boxes – to make it available online in the near future, together with various tools and services.

In the context of documentation and/or research projects and in collaboration with various external partners, the databases in *Explore* are continuously enriched with new data. Examples of such projects include *The Rembrandt Database* (a research resource on Rembrandt paintings), *Dendro4Art* (containing metadata and raw data based on dendrochronological research), *The Arts in Leiden 1475-1575* (containing archival records on artists and craftsmen from the Leiden Archives), as well as the *MARKS on ART database* (containing marks on sculpture, panel paintings and copper plates), which is under construction. *The Bredius Project* dates from very recently, the aim of which is to make Abraham Bredius's archival notes on seventeenth-century Dutch artists digitally available.

The RKD will be familiar territory for many HNA members; others may only know the RKD through the website and *Explore*.

This workshop is intended for participants who want to get acquainted with the wide range of research sources, both digital and analog, that are available at the RKD. Are you currently investigating the provenance of a painting or its material history? Do you want to know what technical documentation can be found at the RKD? Are you curious about what the *MARKS ON ART database* can do for you? Have you never worked with the archival notes of Abraham Bredius before? A number of RKD curators are ready to further familiarize you with the various available research sources that may be important for your research. Participate? Describe your research case in a maximum of 400 words and mail it to laemers@rkd.nl before 1 May 2022.

Attendance is limited to 15 participants.

Multiple Versions of Seventeenth-Century Dutch Paintings

SESSION ORGANIZER

Quentin Buvelot, Mauritshuis, The Hague

LOCATION

Nassauzaal, Mauritshuis, The Hague

In 17th-century Dutch painting, replicas are a rather uncommon phenomenon, with the exclusion of portraiture. Only rarely did painters make second, near identical versions of their paintings. In my present research of the paintings by Jacobus Vrel (active c. 1650-1670), an enigmatic Dutch painter whose oeuvre is limited to only 50 works on panel, I stumbled on a number of replicas, to my great surprise. Apparently, Vrel made some nearly identical versions of both his interior scenes and his street scenes. Sometimes the artist made two versions of the same composition, but in one case multiple versions of one single composition are known. With a few differences in the details, the composition of a genre painting in the Antwerp Museum of Fine Arts is repeated by him in three other versions (Oxford, Washington and San Diego). This aspect of Vrel's oeuvre has never before been studied and is the subject of an essay that I wrote for an upcoming monograph on the artist by Bernd Ebert, Cécile Tainturier and myself.

At present, with the aid of other researchers (some are executing infrared research or dendrochronology as we speak), I am trying to find answers to a number of questions. What is the order of production, i.e. what is in fact the principal version, and what the replica? Is it even possible to establish any order? And did Vrel make these replicas by way of drawings that were transferred onto his panels, or otherwise? And why did he make these replicas? Was it out of commercial reasons, or otherwise? Many of these questions are as yet unanswered.

The ambition of this session is to raise awareness of the phenomenon of versions in Dutch 17th-century art, a subject that is relatively understudied at present. In an ideal world, the research into replicas should be executed by art historians and painting conservators,

working side by side. It is instrumental that all of us learn more about this subject, as to be able to make a distinction between replicas by the master himself, or his workshop, and old copies from the time. In practice, this distinction is not always easy to make. The existence of many replicas in Vrel's oeuvre seem to make the artist unique in 17th-century Dutch painting, but he was not the only one copying himself – some other case studies will be discussed, including but not limited to works by other genre painters of the time, e.g. Gerard ter Borch, Gerrit Dou, Pieter de Hooch and Frans van Mieris the Elder. In this discussion, the production of multiple versions of portraits will also be included.

Attendance is limited to 20 participants.

SPEAKERS

Anna Krekeler, Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

Dina Anchin, National Gallery of Art, Washington D.C.

Sabrina Meloni, Mauritshuis, The Hague

Bedrooms and Courtyards: Two Pairs of near Identical Compositions in the Oeuvre of Pieter de Hooch

Within the oeuvre of Pieter de Hooch (1624 – in or after 1679), there are a number of closely related compositions that share the same space, though the depicted scenes usually differ, as does the position of the observer. However, it is thought, that De Hooch took this repetition in his compositions even further, painting two pairs of near identical versions, in which nearly all of the compositional elements are the same. These two pairs include *The Bedroom* in the collection of The National Gallery of Art, Washington D.C. (NGA) and *In the Bedroom* from the Staatliche Kunsthalle Karlsruhe, both dated around 1661, as well as *A Dutch Courtyard* also at the NGA and *Man Smoking and a Woman Drinking in a Courtyard* at the Mauritshuis in The Hague, dated around 1658-1660.

Through research into De Hooch's painting technique prior to the recent monographic exhibition (*Pieter de Hooch in Delft – From the Shadow of Vermeer*, October 2019 – February 2020, Museum Prinsenhof, Delft), it became clear, that within each of these two pairs of near identical compositions De Hooch approached the implementation of the perspective differently. However, consistently constructed spaces following the rules of linear perspective are a characteristic feature of De Hooch's compositions, with the exception of his earliest works. Yet, the space within the Karlsruhe *Bedroom* seems strikingly implemented by eye alone. These and other initial findings prompted the reassessment of the assumption that De Hooch copied his own compositions. Are all four compositions actually painted by De Hooch himself? Which one is the principle version? What are the technical similarities and differences between the pairs? To shed more light on these questions, thorough comparison of the painting technique of these two pairs was carried out using non-invasive chemical imaging techniques, such as scanning macro X-ray fluorescence (MA-XRF), in addition to other non-invasive and invasive research techniques.

Katja Kleinert, Gemäldegalerie Staatliche Museen zu Berlin

Gerard ter Borch the Younger – Master of Virtuoso Variations and Skillful Marketing

Gallant Conversation by Gerard ter Borch (1617-1681) is one of the icons of seventeenth-century Dutch genre painting. Ter Borch created two versions of this composition, today at the Amsterdam Rijksmuseum and the Gemäldegalerie in Berlin.¹ In addition to these two works, contemporary variations and partial copies have been identified, as well as numerous versions from later centuries. For this reason, the case of *Gallant Conversation* offers particularly rich research material for a more detailed study of work and reproduction practices in the seventeenth-century Dutch Republic.

The exhibition *Gerard ter Borch's Gallant Conversation: A Masterpiece and its Virtuoso Variations* (October 2019 - February 2020, Gemäldegalerie, Berlin) offered the first opportunity to intensively study these two major works from Berlin and Amsterdam, as well as three other contemporary variations. The close, comparative examination of the original paintings and detailed technical research brought about numerous new insights into these works, as well as Ter Borch's working methods. In doing so, questions about the order of production, the development of the motif, as well as the precise transfer and painting processes could be clarified. Still, the question to what extent workshop assistants or pupils of Ter Borch contributed to these variations and repetitions remains unanswered. Ter Borch's masterfully refined painting technique also raised the question of his workshop and reproduction practices, which enabled striking similarities between paintings that are astounding for the accuracy of the details, drapery folds and light reflections.

As the examinations showed, the Berlin painting originally matched the Amsterdam version almost completely with regard to both format and imagery. Only later, presumably in the eighteenth century, was it trimmed and revised. Ter Borch thus produced the *Gallant Conversation* in two identical versions, a procedure that can also be demonstrated for other paintings by the artist. Only during a subsequent step, the figure in a satin dress, seen from the back, was extracted and became an independent motif. The enigmatic and attractive qualities of this figure made it eminently suitable for wide distribution. By making small adjustments, it was possible to embed her in a wide variety of contexts. This kind of transformation and adaptation places a clear spotlight on the extremely skillful marketing of Ter Borch's astonishingly changeable pictorial inventions.

It can be assumed that there was a great variety of forms of repetition and variation in seventeenth-century Dutch painting, the range of which we have little knowledge of and which has so far only been explored in part. The examination of Ter Borch's *Gallant Conversations* provides us with insights that reveal what a high level of creativity and artistry was required if one wanted to produce effectively, yet at the same time be able to offer to the public works of the highest quality.

¹ A third, significantly modified version entitled *A Singing Practice*, is at the National Galleries of Scotland, Edinburgh.

Visit to the exhibition *In Full Bloom (In volle bloei)*, Mauritshuis (max. 20 participants), with Ariane van Suchtelen, Mauritshuis

This year the Mauritshuis celebrates its 200th birthday. The exhibition *In Full Bloom* takes you on a voyage of discovery through the flower still-life genre.

Colourful flowers. It seems like an obvious subject in art, but remarkably enough, it was only after 1600 that the flower still-life genre began to flourish in Dutch and Flemish painting. Cheerful bouquets and exotic blooms are characteristic of the genre, as are meticulous detail, scarcity and variation. What prompted did this sudden interest in flower still lifes? How did talented women artists and researchers gain international fame? And what was the role of science in all of this?

Visit to the Prince William V Gallery (max. 20 participants), with Marie Mundigler

The Prince William V Gallery (Galerij Prins Willem V), the hidden gem of The Hague, is the very first museum of the Netherlands. Prince William V of Oranje-Nassau commissioned the construction of the room in 1774 to accommodate his impressive collection of paintings and exhibit it to the public. The walls are completely covered in this generous display of the wealth of his collection.

More than 150 old masters from the Mauritshuis collection (including works by Steen, Rubens and Potter) hang here side by side. Crystal chandeliers, silk wall coverings and lavish curtains complete the regal atmosphere. Enjoy an imaginary moment in the court of the Stadtholder in the Prince William V Gallery.

Visit to the Haags Historisch Museum on the occasion of 800 year Binnenhof (max. 20 participants), with Lex van Tilborg, Haags Historisch Museum

The Binnenhof in The Hague has been the battleground of power for eight hundred years. This history makes the Binnenhof one of the oldest administrative centres in the world. In this symbolic place, power has taken on different forms throughout the centuries, with changing players, winners and losers, good and bad, and democracy as a result. In the Historical Museum of The Hague unique objects and works of art are on display that illustrate the history of the Binnenhof, such as the tongue and finger of the De Witt brothers, the throne of King Willem III and the buttons of the so-called Dolle Mina's, a Dutch feminist group from the twentieth century.